National Register Nomination: the McCloughan Mansion, 315 Old Allerton Road, Annandale NJ 08801

Leaha Bovino

Roger Williams University, lbovino388@g.rwu.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://docs.rwu.edu/hp_capstone_project

Recommended Citation


https://docs.rwu.edu/hp_capstone_project/4
National Register Nomination

The McCloughan Mansion
315 Old Allerton Road, Annandale NJ 08801

Leaha Bovino
Master of Science, Historic Preservation
School of Architecture, Art and Historic Preservation
Roger Williams University
May 2014
SIGNATURE PAGE:

National Register Nomination
The McCloughan Mansion
315 Old Allerton Road, Annandale NJ 08801

Author: Leaha Bovino

Signature: ________________________________

Date of Signature: _______________________

Advisor: Jeremy C. Wells, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor of Historic Preservation
Roger Williams University, Bristol, Rhode Island

Signature: ________________________________

Date of Signature: _______________________

Reader: Quinn Stuart
Architectural Historian
Public Archaeology Laboratory

Signature: ________________________________

Date of Signature: 5/15/2019

Dean: Stephen White, AIA
Dean of the School of Architecture, Art, and Historic Preservation
Roger Williams University, Bristol, Rhode Island

Signature: ________________________________

Date of Signature: _______________________

ABSTRACT:

The McCloughan Mansion is an Italianate-style house located in Annandale, New Jersey on five acres of land and includes two outbuildings, a small barn and a second dwelling. The mansion was constructed between 1860 and 1870 and is significant under Criterion C in the area of Architecture. The McCloughan Mansion is an excellent example of Italianate design executed in brick masonry that is uncommon in the architectural context of the town of Annandale. Furthermore, repetitive segmental-arched architectural elements distinguish the McCloughan Mansion from typical orthogonal implementations of Italianate design, and give this property an iconic identity. The property retains a high degree of historic fabric and integrity, including its setting in a Picturesque, park-like landscape, thus remaining as an accurate illustration of its period of significance in the 1860s and 70s.
1. Name of Property
   Historic name: McCloughan Mansion
   Other names/site number: 
   Name of related multiple property listing:
   N/A
   (Enter "N/A" if property is not part of a multiple property listing)

2. Location
   Street & number: 315 Old Allerton Road
   City or town: Annandale
   State: New Jersey
   County: Hunterdon
   Not For Publication: ☒
   Vicinity: 

3. State/Federal Agency Certification
   As the designated authority under the National Historic Preservation Act, as amended, I hereby certify that this ___ nomination ___ request for determination of eligibility meets the documentation standards for registering properties in the National Register of Historic Places and meets the procedural and professional requirements set forth in 36 CFR Part 60.

   In my opinion, the property ___ meets ___ does not meet the National Register Criteria. I recommend that this property be considered significant at the following level(s) of significance:
   ___national   ___statewide   ___local
   Applicable National Register Criteria:
   ___A   ___B   X_C   ___D

   Signature of certifying official/Title: ____________________________
   Date: ____________

   State or Federal agency/bureau or Tribal Government
In my opinion, the property ___ meets ___ does not meet the National Register criteria.

Signature of commenting official: __________________________ Date: ____________

Title: __________________________ State or Federal agency/bureau or Tribal Government __________________________

4. National Park Service Certification

I hereby certify that this property is:

___ entered in the National Register
___ determined eligible for the National Register
___ determined not eligible for the National Register
___ removed from the National Register

X other (explain:) The New Jersey State Historic Preservation Office has not conducted a preliminary study to determine the eligibility of the McCloughan Mansion for inclusion in the National Register.

Signature of the Keeper: __________________________ Date of Action: ____________

5. Classification

Ownership of Property

(Check as many boxes as apply.)

Private: x

Public – Local

Public – State

Public – Federal

Category of Property

(Check only one box.)

Building(s) x

District
## McCloughan Mansion

### Number of Resources within Property

(Do not include previously listed resources in the count)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Contributing</th>
<th>Noncontributing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Buildings</td>
<td><em><strong><strong>1</strong></strong></em></td>
<td><em><strong><strong>2</strong></strong></em>_</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sites</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structures</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objects</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td><em><strong><strong>1</strong></strong></em></td>
<td><em><strong><strong>2</strong></strong></em>_</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Number of contributing resources previously listed in the National Register ________

### 6. Function or Use

#### Historic Functions

(Enter categories from instructions.)

**Domestic/**

- Single Dwelling
- __________________
- __________________
- __________________
- __________________
- __________________

#### Current Functions

(Enter categories from instructions.)

**Vacant/**

- Not In Use
- __________________
- __________________
- __________________
- __________________
7. Description

Architectural Classification
(Enter categories from instructions.)
Mid-19th Century
       Italian Villa

Materials: (Enter categories from instructions.)
Principal exterior materials of the property: Brick
       Foundation: Stone
       Walls: Brick
       Roof: Metal
       Other: Wood, Brick

Narrative Description
(Describe the historic and current physical appearance and condition of the property. Describe contributing and noncontributing resources if applicable. Begin with a summary paragraph that briefly describes the general characteristics of the property, such as its location, type, style, method of construction, setting, size, and significant features. Indicate whether the property has historic integrity.)

Summary Paragraph

315 Old Allerton Road, also known as the McCloughan Mansion, is a two-and-one-half-story, 5,292 square-foot, brick Italianate dwelling. The east (facade) elevation faces Old Allerton Road and is accessible by a semicircular drive. The McCloughan Mansion is identifiable by its large segmented arches that are a reoccurring element of its design in the main block, veranda, and cupola. The house is situated on 5.02 acres that slopes downwards towards the west and contains many trees. The historic Runkle Family Cemetery bounds the property partially on the northwest perimeter, and a discontinued road bounds the property to the North. In addition to the McCloughan Mansion, a secondary dwelling and a small outbuilding are to the West of the primary dwelling. The house seems to be structurally sound, yet is in poor condition in terms of finishes, features, and fixtures, and is uninhabitable. The McCloughan Mansion, LLC. purchased the house in 2012 and conducted emergency stabilization repairs and general cosmetic fixes to appeal to potential buyers. The house retains much historical integrity, first in its location and setting. The house still sits on its original foundation and it is evident that the house once was
part of a well-maintained estate as evidenced by landscape features such as a terraced grass tennis court, outdoor stone fireplace, planted hedges, and the remains of a collection of outbuildings, many of which have since been demolished. The exterior design of the house is largely intact, namely the proportion and massing of the structure, the arched window and door openings with original sash and doors, bracketed cornices with large dentals, a low-pitched hip roof and large central cupola. The original brick and wood materiality and workmanship was respected while making recent repairs, as rotted wooden elements were replaced or repaired in kind and painted to match. Although not as obvious now, the McCloughan Mansion and landscape still evokes feelings of purposeful architectural design and an association with grandeur for a prominent estate in the mid- to late nineteenth century.

Narrative Description

The McCloughan Mansion was a private residential dwelling located on Old Allerton Road in Annandale, New Jersey. The house is on the outskirts of the downtown, as such, it was not included in the Annandale Historic District. The estate is a large plot of land that is 5.02 acres and is surrounded by full-grown trees. The east (façade) elevation, faces Old Allerton Road, but is set back and separated from the street by a row of hedges. In the estate’s history, a second dwelling that is speculated to be a converted carriage house, garage, barn, clubhouse, and outhouse were located to the South and West of the McCloughan Mansion; however, only the second dwelling and barn remain standing. All other structures besides the mansion were wood-frame construction. An unpaved semi-circular driveway enters and exits onto Old Allerton Road. A part of the driveway extends along the North Elevation and culminates in a roundabout north of the second dwelling and where the garage used to be. The remains of a grass tennis court to the South of the mansion is mostly overgrown by vegetation, yet the net poles and some of the tape to delineate the court are still identifiable.

The overall massing of the house is cubical as evidenced by the three-bay width and the three-pile depth. The dwelling is two-and-one-half-stories high; the third floor contains habitable spaces with sloping ceilings to mirror the roof pitches. There is also a fully accessible basement. The foundation was local fieldstone and is parged on the exterior with cement, but large areas have delaminated on the West and South elevations. The outer walls are masonry and the interior structure is balloon-framed. The exterior brick masonry walls were laid such that the outer perimeter on both the vertical edges and along the top of the wall plane are raised, leaving the interior portion that contains the fenestration and door openings slightly recessed. This creates a dimensional shadow line on an otherwise simple massing. Lastly, all wood trim, clapboards, shutters, windows, doors, veranda and porches are all painted white, providing a contrast of materiality and design.

The plan is a typical center entry hall configuration with a parlor on either side at the east of the house, and a kitchen, pantry, and dining room at the west (rear) end. The dining room’s dimensions extend further than the kitchen, thus, the rear of the building does not share the same
flat wall plane as the other three elevations. The center hall turns to make an “L” shape to accommodate the staircase that runs perpendicular to the entry hall.

A large veranda wraps around the façade and north elevation. It features a segmental arch motif at the center of each elevation. Twelve square wood columns with a paneled design along the outside edges support the veranda roof. The wood bases are at grade and feature a paneled design as well. The veranda floor level is approximately two feet above grade and is accessed by three concrete steps that are centered on the east elevation and three wood steps on the north elevation. The space beneath the veranda is enclosed with wooden lattice. The rear of the building has an exterior porch that has been partially enclosed by wood paneling. This porch only has one surviving square wood column with a simple capital built up with molding profile and does not retain its integrity of design. Brick piers support the porch and the bottom space is partially enclosed with wooden lattice. The exterior stairs that once led to this space have been removed. A cement-parged well is enclosed in its own hip-roof, wood-panel structure and features a twelve-light window on the west elevation. This well “house” is accessible from inside the porch. Exterior access to the basement is also from the west elevation underneath this porch. A set of concrete steps descends to the basement floor level and a wood paneled door.

The north, south, and east elevations each feature a large brick segmental-arched pediment along the roofline. A frieze with large dentals and an overhanging cornice wraps around the entire building, following the curvature of the arches. The gutters are integrated into this cornice. Five sets of paired wood scroll brackets support the cornice on the three elevations with arches. The veranda and porch have flat-seamed tin roofing. The roof of the main block of the house is clad with standing-seam tin roofing. The roof shape is hip; however, the curvature of the large arches results in semi-cylindrical projections of the rooflines. There are four brick chimneys that appear to be spaced evenly in a square shape.

A significant character-defining feature of the McCloughan Mansion is the large central cupola. The cupola is geometrically square and features centered arches at the top of each elevation. The cupola is clad with wood clapboard and each corner has a paneled pilaster of the same design as the veranda columns. Each of the four elevations of the cupola has a pair of arched, one-over-one, wood double-hung sash. The roof materiality appears to be the same standing-seam tin as the main block.

The windows on the north, south, and east elevations are all are wood framed and arched with corresponding arched brick openings, brick arched window heads, stone sills, and paired in sets of two. The east elevation features three window sizes; the first floor windows that look onto the veranda stretch to the floor and are double-hung with two large lights over one. There are two pairs on this elevation. The second and third floor windows are double hung one over one, yet those on the third floor are much smaller. The second floor features three pairs of windows, and the third only has a singular pair centered on the wall plane. The windows on the North elevation follow the same pattern, yet only the pair on the East corner of the elevation stretch to the porch floor, otherwise, the windows follow the same fenestration as the east elevation. The south elevation also has a window fenestration that mirrors that of the north elevation. The overall
effect is that the windows decrease in size as they ascend up the elevation. The north and east elevations retain their original wooden louvered shutters with arched tops to match the windows and the historic hinges are intact. The south and west elevation shutters are missing, but their previous existence is obvious due to discoloration of the brick wall where they used to hang. Moreover, the foundation at grade level features two window openings on both the north and south elevations; however, those on the north are not visible from the exterior due to the veranda. The style of these windows is unknown due to wooden boards being placed over them on the south elevation. The west elevation windows differ from those on the other three elevations because although they are dimensionally and geometrically the same, they have four lights over four lights on the first and second floor. The third floor has four pairs of square casement windows, and one singular of the same design.

The McCloughan Mansion has two primary entrances that enter into the central hall on the east elevation and the stair hall on the north elevation. Both entrances are centered within their respective elevations. The entry on the east elevation is a double door with a segmental arch top. The doors are wood and feature two inset panels on each. The original hardware is no longer extant. The entrance on the north elevation has a singular wood door that has four inset panels; the top two panels are arched. This door is rectangular, but has a segmental arch transom window with a singular pane of glass. The hardware is also missing. Additionally, there were two secondary entrances on the first floor. One used to access the dining room (broken down by vandals) and the other accessed the kitchen. These doorways cannot be seen from the exterior as they are enclosed within the rear porch.
McCloughan Mansion
Name of Property

Hunterdon NJ
County and State

McCloughan Mansion


McCloughan Mansion  
Name of Property  

Hunterdon NJ  
County and State  


McCloughan Mansion

Name of Property

Hunterdon NJ

County and State


8. Statement of Significance

Applicable National Register Criteria
(Mark "x" in one or more boxes for the criteria qualifying the property for National Register listing.)

☐ A. Property is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.

☐ B. Property is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past.

☒ C. Property embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction.

☐ D. Property has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

Criteria Considerations
(Mark “x” in all the boxes that apply.)

☐ A. Owned by a religious institution or used for religious purposes

☐ B. Removed from its original location

☐ C. A birthplace or grave

☐ D. A cemetery

☐ E. A reconstructed building, object, or structure

☐ F. A commemorative property

☐ G. Less than 50 years old or achieving significance within the past 50 years
**Areas of Significance**  
(Enter categories from instructions.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Architecture</th>
<th>Significant Person</th>
<th>(Complete only if Criterion B is marked above.)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Period of Significance**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1860-1870</th>
<th>Cultural Affiliation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Significant Dates**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1860-1870</th>
<th>Architect/Builder</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Statement of Significance Summary Paragraph** (Provide a summary paragraph that includes level of significance, applicable criteria, justification for the period of significance, and any applicable criteria considerations.)

The McCloughan Mansion is an Italianate-style house located in Annandale, New Jersey on five acres of land, and includes two outbuildings, a small barn and a second dwelling. The mansion was constructed between 1860 and 1870 and is significant under Criterion C in the area of Architecture. The McCloughan Mansion is an excellent example of Italianate design executed in brick masonry that is uncommon in the architectural context of the town of Annandale. Furthermore, repetitive segmental-arched architectural elements distinguish the McCloughan Mansion from typical orthogonal implementations of Italianate design, and give this property an iconic identity. The property retains a high degree of historic fabric and integrity, including its setting in a Picturesque, park-like landscape, thus remaining as an accurate illustration of its period of significance in the 1860s and 70s.
Narrative Statement of Significance (Provide at least one paragraph for each area of significance.)

Building History

The McCloughan Mansion, was likely built by Henry McCloughan between 1860 and 1870 based on a significant increase in assessed property value from $18,000 in 1860 to $70,000 in 1870.\(^1\) The Italianate architectural style provides further evidence to support this construction date. Unfortunately, no other evidence could be located to provide a more precise date.

When it was constructed, the McCloughan Mansion and property comprised one of the more impressive and expensive estates in the vicinity.\(^2\) It is probable that John McCloughan, who purchased the property in 1870, was responsible for introducing electricity to the McCloughan Mansion, and evidence of the original system still remains intact in the form of push-button light switches.

In 1913, Euphemia McCloughan sold the property to Browne Morgan for $18,000.\(^3\) The carriage house to the west of the mansion was likely converted into a residential space during Morgan’s ownership, as the style of the wood-frame garage that was built to the northwest of the carriage house was in a craftsman-like style and indicative of early 1920s garage design. In 1929, Browne Morgan sold the property for one dollar to his father, George W. Morgan.\(^4\) Two years later, in 1931, Browne Morgan executed the estate of George W. Morgan, deceased. It was at this point that the 184-acre plot of land was divided and parcels were sold separately.\(^5\) 179 acres were sold to The State of New Jersey for $34,000 in 1947.\(^6\) The five remaining acres containing the house and outbuildings was sold to George L. Gilbert and Philip B. Gilbert for a sum of $20,000, also in 1947.\(^7\)

In 1950, George L. Gilbert and Philip B. Gilbert added Eleanor C. Tinnes to the deed for one dollar such that each party had claim to one-third interest in the property.\(^8\) In 1952, Eleanor C.

---


\(^3\) Deed of Sale from Euphemia Runkle to Browne Morgan, 7 January 1913, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 307, page 679. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.

\(^4\) Deed of Sale from Browne Morgan to George W. Morgan, 18 March 1929, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 377, page 597. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.

\(^5\) Deed of Sale from Browne Morgan to Browne Morgan al Trust, 18 April 1931, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 387, page 545. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.

\(^6\) Deed of Sale from Browne Morgan to The State of New Jersey, 29 January 1947, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 462, page 340. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.

\(^7\) Deed of Sale from Browne Morgan to George L. Gilbert et al, 1 May 1837, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 463, page 177. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.

\(^8\) Deed of Sale from Philip B. Gilbert et al. to Eleanor C. Tinnes, 4 March 1950, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 68, page 172. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.
Tinnes bought George L. Gilbert’s share of the five-acre property. 9 Philip B. Gilbert et als. sold the McCloughan Mansion property and an adjacent plot to Thomas P. Golden Jr. and Patricia S. Golden in 1969. The two parcels equaled approximately eleven acres and were bought for $45,000.10 Nine years later, the Goldens sold the two parcels to Clinton Point Associates for $152,500 in 1978.11 This sale ended the McCloughan Mansion’s one hundred year existence as a single-family private residence.

Clinton Point Associates received preliminary approval from the Clinton Township Planning Board in 1987 to develop the site and fourteen other acres into a 23,000 square-foot office building and retail complex. The developers were planning to demolish the McCloughan Mansion and its associated outbuildings to accommodate the new construction. 12 Additionally, the historic Runkle Cemetery located to the west of the property was threatened by this development as Clinton Point Associates were petitioning to have the graves moved to a different cemetery. The controversy of the Runkle Cemetery stalled the developer’s plans as Runkle family descendants, the Clinton Township Historical Committee and local residents rallied to preserve the cemetery and the equally threatened McCloughan Mansion in situ.13 The case was brought to the state Superior Court where the judge ruled that the heirs of the Runkle family “own” the cemetery and that the decision to relocate the graves is theirs.14 By the spring of 1991, the Runkle Family Association had achieved a court order that prevented Clinton Point Associates from disturbing the cemetery.15 Meanwhile, the McCloughan Mansion had become a rental property and had little to no maintenance. Throughout the 1990s and early 2000s, Clinton Point Associates attempted to have development plans for an affordable housing complex officially approved by the town, yet all were rejected. These rejections were indicative of the Annandale and Clinton Township community’s preference for preservation of the McCloughan Mansion, despite the house rapidly becoming a case study in demolition by neglect under ownership of the Clinton Point Associates.

The McCloughan Mansion was identified as one of Preservation New Jersey’s 10 Most Endangered Sites in New Jersey in 2003, and the house was last occupied in 2004.16 In 2001, 2006, and 2011 various banks bought the taxes of the property as Clinton Point Associates accumulated unpaid municipal liens. Crusader Servicing Corporation obtained ownership of the property from Clinton Point Associates in March of 2011.17 The following year in March of 2012, Michael Margulies bought the McCloughan property from Crusader Servicing Corporation.

---

9 Deed of Sale from George L. Gilbert to Eleanor C. Tinnes, 18 September 1952, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 526, page 576. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.
11 Deed of Sale from Patricia S. Golden to Clinton Point Associates, 26 June 1978, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 829, page 554. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.
McCloughan Mansion

Name of Property: McCloughan Mansion

County and State: Hunterdon NJ

for $116,000.18 Michael Margulies is an architect and created the McCloughan Mansion, LLC. and formally transferred the deed for one dollar in June of 2012; work began on the house not long after. Emergency stabilization and repairs of the McCloughan Mansion focused primarily on replacing rotten and collapsing porch elements, missing or irreparably damaged cornice, fascia, gutter and roof systems, clearing debris, garbage, and vandalism, landscaping and tree removal and selective demolition of the outhouse, garage, and clubhouse. Margulies also conducted some general demolition of finishes and furniture elements outside of the period of significance and cleaning of the interior spaces. The mansion and five acres of land have been for sale since the spring of 2013 and is currently listed for $490,000. Currently, the McCloughan Mansion is still in need of a thorough rehabilitation and is not inhabitable, yet for now, the threat of demolition by developers or neglect is gone.

**Context for Criterion “C”**

**The Picturesque Movement**

*Origins in Landscape*

The Picturesque Movement originated in eighteenth century English philosophy of design. High styles of formal gardening at the beginning of the Picturesque Movement were still taking cues from seventeenth-century French gardens that were designed in “geometric patterns against lines of sight to make illusions of scale.” The discussion of nature and newfound interest in neo-classical architecture led to a new approach to gardening that rejected this geometric composition and classical formality. What is now known as an “English Garden” rose in popularity as a reflection of the shift in landscape philosophy. The English Garden exhibited the ideals of the Picturesque through an irregular plan configuration and allowed vegetation and trees to grow freely and naturally. Experiential perspectives and vignettes of the landscape were created instead of the straight lines of sight that were found in classical design. The Picturesque landscape was one that encouraged movement through nature and fostered an ideal of discovery by travel through a landscape.

**Architectural Inspiration**

The evolution of architecture to fit within the Picturesque framework also found its origins in Britain. Macarthur describes that “architectural discourse and design were archaeologically inspired historicist styles”, however, the historical accuracy of classical designs were in conflict with the Picturesque ideals of appearance. Architecture of the Picturesque began with stylistic exercises in classical antiquity, however, the design approach and end goal of the Picturesque were a paradox. Achievement of the Picturesque appearance was through asymmetrical plans

---

18 Deed of Sale from Crusader Servicing Corporation to Michael Margulies, 26 March 2012, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 2275, page 854. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.
23 IBID, 13.
and irregular forms, whereas classical architecture was one composed of distinct orders. 24 As such, historical accuracy was re-interpreted as “revivalist” design with a focus on themes found in classicism. 25 Such revivalist designs were incorporated into the Picturesque landscape and created a juxtaposition of man-made structures against a seemingly natural setting. W. Barksdale Maynard in Architecture in the United States, 1800-1850 simplifies the movement by suggesting to think of the Picturesque as “romanticism” applied to architecture and its context of landscape with a focus on naturalness, variety, and irregularity. 26 As such, Picturesque buildings and landscapes evoke nostalgia about the past or a specific period of time. 27

The Picturesque in America

Expatriate architects from Britain helped bring the ideals of the Picturesque Movement across the Atlantic Ocean to American design in the early nineteenth century. 28 According to Maynard, the first five decades of the nineteenth century saw a gradual replacement of the “harmonious and widespread” American Federal aesthetic with an increase in varied architectural inspiration. 29 Many of the transferred approaches to American design were through the expatriated British architects who had traveled and gone on tours of antiquity. As such, the aesthetics shifted from federal delicacy to heavier, more archaeological influences, such as Greek and Roman design. 30 Although the United States of America had spent its formative years trying to achieve a uniquely American architectural expression, the ties to Britain were ultimately revived during this period. Throughout the nineteenth and early twentieth century, high-style American architecture can trace its roots back to English traditions and ideals. 31 However, Maynard also points out that there was a “time lag” in transmission of architectural and landscape notions from Britain to America in the early decades of the nineteenth century. 32

Italianate Architecture

Origins

Italianate architecture was one of the romanticized styles of building in the 19th century that exemplified Picturesque ideals of revivalism and relationships within a landscape. The Italianate villa design was inspired by the architecture in the rural areas of northern Italy and brought to England by architects and academics in the 1830s. 33 John Nash, a British architect, built an

24 Ibid, 13, 110.
31 Maynard. Architecture in the United States, 1800-1850, 64.
32 Ibid. 52.
“Italian Villa” at Cronkhill, Shropshire, as early as 1802 that was a mix of classical architecture with elements of architectural history from the Italian Renaissance and Baroque paintings.  

Thirty-five years passed before the Italianate villa form that had been developed by Nash at Cronkhill surfaced as a variant in Notman’s Bishop Doane House in Burlington, New Jersey (1837). Although the style’s origins were similar, Italianate architecture in America developed later in time and in a different context. It was considered as a “variant of Gothic” revival. As such, Italianate architecture had mass appeal as a means of creating aesthetic qualities and cultural expression of gothic revival for people of the time that could not relate to the eccentricities and foreign character of medieval forms. Thus, Italianate architecture was particularly popular in America in the 1850s-1880s. Designers and theorists, such as Andrew Jackson Downing and Andrew Jackson Davis, also welcomed the architectural inspiration of Italy as an opportunity to experiment with the ideals of the Picturesque Movement in America.

Associated Ideals and Attitudes

Alan Gowan, author of *Architecture in New Jersey*, described that the period of prosperity in America also made Italianate architecture attractive. The expansion of wealth, trade, commerce, territory, and population caused the activities of the upper classes to shift in terms of leisure including study and discussion of cultural and artistic matters. The new attitude toward architecture was one of not simply building for “commodity, firmness, and delight”, as older theoreticians had defined it, but rather architecture increasingly came to be thought of as a kind of symbolic language, and a vehicle for communicating ideas.

Architectural Style Characteristics

Italianate architecture has key elements that are quintessentially character defining for this style. High-style Italianate architecture had low roofs that could be gabled, hipped, or a combination of the two. Overhanging eaves with decorative brackets are trademarks of this style as are round-headed windows with hood moldings, usually paired. Arcaded porches, referred to as loggias or piazzas were typical and exterior materiality was often stucco. Additionally, taking cues directly from the architecture of Italy, many American Italianate buildings featured an entrance tower and balustrade balconies. Simple Italianate buildings typically were square in form with low pyramidal roofs, bracketed eaves, and may have had cupolas or lanterns. A gable fronted house may also be considered Italianate if it includes characteristics such as the aforementioned large overhanging eaves, multilevel porches, and decorative trim indicative of the period. The Italianate style has visually prominent features and a “tendency rather towards boldness than

35 Maynard, 2002, pg. 52
minute decoration”. Helen Schwartz in *The New Jersey House* describes the relationship of an Italian Villa, a high-style Italianate country house, to the surrounding landscape as such, “The villa, with its high, square tower, round-arched windows, and studied asymmetry satisfied the desire for the ‘picturesque’. Its eccentricities of silhouette and asymmetrical façade created by the variety of window groupings allowed the Italianate house … to sit naturally in the landscape and create a harmonious vista”.

**Variations of Architectural Style**

As mentioned earlier, the Italianate style appealed to a large American population, and its flexibility in conception and execution had something for “every taste and station in life”. Part of the appeal in flexibility was that rural artisans were able to easily adjust their skills to execute Italianate design. Even though patterns for Italianate design existed in publications such as trade journals, local builders made adaptations, adjustments, simplifications and exaggerations to design, depending on geographic location, skill level, and personal taste. At the high-style level of design and architectural academia, designers such as Alexander Jackson Downing capitalized on the appeal of options to homeowners and builders. His designs included selections of a “suburban cottage”, a grander “villa”, or the “Anglo-Italian villa”, an architecturally simplified version. Lastly, a variation of the Italianate home was the less dramatic, yet equally popular “Cube Italian” as referred to by some historians. A low over-hanging roof supported by brackets and topped with a central cupola sheltered the house. The cupola was often adorned with large finials. This style also had a front porch that ran the entire width of the house.

**Popularity**

The more desirable the notion of the “Picturesque” became, the more popular Italianate design became in America. According to Alan Gowan, the Italianate style became so popular that it was the most uniform application of a national style the United States had had since the early days of Greek Revival during the 1850s. This notion is agreed upon in published literature as John Poppeliers and S. Allen Chambers, Jr., authors of *What Style Is It: A Guide to American Architecture*, concur with the observation that the adaptability of the Italianate Style made this style of architecture immensely popular and gain connotations of an American national

---

identity.53 Furthermore, Gowan addressed the trend as “dominating” architecture from the middle of the 1840s through the 1850s.54

Although residential villas and homes commonly employed Italianate design, the style’s ornamentation was also employed for commercial buildings and urban row houses, as well as many federally sponsored buildings such as post offices and customhouses.55 The development of cast iron and pressed metal technology during the mid nineteenth century made production of these decorative ornamentation elements widely economical and more affordable than the same elements carved from stone.56 Aside from design adaptability of Italianate architecture, the style also allowed for flexibility depending on economics. For example, not all farmers could afford the ostentation of high Italianate style, but the architecturally basic Cube Italian house that included identifiable features such as large overhanging eaves, scroll brackets, and large porches, proved to be appealing in agricultural settings regardless.57 The Cube Italian house remained popular after the Civil War, but developed more ornament such as tall parlor windows, embellished porches, and paired brackets. These details morphed the “Cube Italian” into the “American Bracketed Villa” and solidified its popularity.58

Italianate Architecture in New Jersey
Prevalence, Design, and Popularity

Gowan prefaces the discussion of Italianate architecture in New Jersey by asserting that the state is unparalleled in its variety of interpretations of the style.59 Robert P. Guter and Janet W. Foster claim that New Jersey owes its excellent reputation of Italianate architecture to the villas “Prospect” and “Guernsey Hall” both located in Princeton, New Jersey, as the prime precedents for other Italianate buildings in the state. John Notman designed these two architectural works; Alexander Jackson Downing also published Notman’s designs.60

As in other areas of the country, local builders and craftsmen in New Jersey found that Italianate forms were easily adaptable to old regional traditions, such as executing the designs using wood construction in Hunterdon County.61 Guter and Foster emphasized the impact that the pattern book publisher, Samuel Sloan, had on design particularly in this state. Sloan published many Romantic designs, in works such as The Model Architect, but his designs for domestic Italianate

59 Gowans, Architecture in New Jersey, 77.
houses were “particularly influential in New Jersey”. Successful merchants were not the only demographic that utilized such pattern books to construct their homes; prosperous farmers also adopted published designs. While grandiose designs that reflected the ideals of the Picturesque were often published, many were intended for masonry construction and large budgets; as such, large-scale masonry homes were not often built in New Jersey. “Cottage-villas”, rather than mansions were “the mainstay of the Italianate in most places”. Along with Gothic Revival styles, the Italianate influenced most domestic architecture as evidenced by the examples that can be seen in New Jersey towns that developed right before the Civil War. The longevity of Italianate architecture was not negatively affected by the war; the style continued to flourish after its conclusion. Schwartz explains, “Much of New Jersey’s Italianate architecture consists of the simple versions of the style that were carpenters’ interpretations of pattern books.”

The McCloughan Mansion

The McCloughan Mansion is significant under criterion C for its representation of Italianate architecture in Annandale, New Jersey. Although the mansion is not included in the boundary for the Annandale Historic District, the district provides a baseline understanding for the types of architectural styles that are prominent in the area. The historic district includes 147 buildings, primarily residential, and mentions Gothic Revival, Queen Anne, Italianate, and Craftsman styles the most frequently. Of those 147 surveyed buildings, there are twelve that are noted for having “Italianate influences” such as arched-top windows, brackets, box cornices, and low-pitched roofs, and only one is identified as being pure Italianate design but has undergone substantial alterations outside its period of significance.

In an area that has a primarily agricultural heritage, high-style pieces of architecture are unusual; instead, vernacular interpretations or simplified designs of popular styles were more common and accessible for farmers and laborers that populated the town. This was broadly typical for architecture in rural New Jersey as carpenters and craftsmen would utilize pattern books and trade journals as the basis for design. Expensive high-style designs that intended to be built using masonry were often executed using the resources more readily available in Hunterdon County, such as timber, and were scaled down from grandiose villa proportions to modest family homes. As such, most houses with Italianate design influences in Annandale are wood-frame construction, with simple end-gable massing, clapboard siding, and applied Italianate ornamentation, such as brackets or decorative column posts.

In contrast, the McCloughan Mansion is primarily constructed of brick masonry with wood ornamentation, has a large amount of square footage, and exemplifies an integrated and consistent Italianate design, thus illustrating the wealth of the McCloughan family. The most

66 Bertland, Dennis N.. *Annandale Historic District*.
unique and identifiable architectural design component of the McCloughan Mansion is the repetitive segmental-arch motif that appears in the roof of the veranda, in the brick masonry wall planes, and at the top of the cupola. This architectural detail is not considered to be a predominant design feature in New Jersey and no other building in Annandale exhibits it.

Furthermore, the McCloughan Mansion typifies Italianate design through its square form, low-pitched modified hip roof with overhanging eaves and large decorative cornice supported by paired scroll brackets. Large, single-paned, round-headed windows, and full-wall length parlor windows are also characteristic of the style. The wide column-arcaded veranda that wraps the house on two elevations is a luxurious interpretation of this common feature. The prominent central cupola completes the McCloughan Mansion’s embodiment of the Italianate style.

Lastly, the McCloughan Mansion property exhibits the ideals of the Picturesque Movement through an irregular configuration of outbuildings, trees, plantings, and landscape features. The landscape was planned such that the McCloughan Mansion was the focal point of the property, yet is shielded from the street by hedges such that it is only revealed once ascending the curved driveway. There are no orthogonal axes of visual vignettes and different views could be had from every room of the house. The McCloughan Mansion exemplifies a Picturesque juxtaposition of man-made structures amongst a natural vegetative setting.

1873 Map of Annandale. Beers, Constock & Cline. 1873.

9. Major Bibliographical References

Bibliography (Cite the books, articles, and other sources used in preparing this form.)


Annandale Village. "Annandale, New Jersey, 1886."
   http://www.annandalevillage.com/gallery/1886_annandale_map.jpg

   http://interactive.ancestry.com/7667/4235180_00170/54949479?backurl=http%3a%2f%2fsearch.ancestry.com%2fcgi-bin%2fssel.dll%3fgst%3d-12&ssrc=&backlabel=ReturnSearchResults
   (accessed May 14, 2014).

   http://interactive.ancestry.com/7163/4273782_00175/25516405?backurl=http%3a%2f%2fsearch.ancestry.com%2fcgi-bin%2fssel.dll%3fgst%3d-12&ssrc=&backlabel=ReturnSearchResults
   (accessed May 14, 2014).


Deed of Sale from Browne Morgan to George L. Gilbert et al, 1 May 1837, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 463, page 177. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.

Deed of Sale from Browne Morgan to George W. Morgan, 18 March 1929, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 377, page 597. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.

Deed of Sale from Browne Morgan to The State of New Jersey, 29 January 1947, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 462, page 340. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.

Deed of Sale from Crusader Servicing Corporation to Michael Margulies, 26 March 2012, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 2275, page 854. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.

Deed of Sale from Euphemia Runkle to Browne Morgan, 7 January 1913, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 307, page 679. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.

Deed of Sale from George L. Gilbert, to Eleanor C. Tinnes, 18 September 1952, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 526, page 576. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.

Deed of Sale from George W. Morgan to Browne Morgan al Trust, 18 April 1931, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 387, page 545. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.
Deed of Sale from Henry McCloughan to John McCloughan, 30 March 1870, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 145, page 179. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.

Deed of Sale from Jacob Runkle to Henry McCloughan, 1 May 1837, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 68, page 172. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.


Deed of Sale from Patricia S. Golden. to Clinton Point Associates, 26 June 1978, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 829, page 554. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.

Deed of Sale from Philip B. Gilbert et al. to Eleanor C. Tinnes, 4 March 1950, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 68, page 172. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.


McCloughan Mansion
Name of Property


---

Previous documentation on file (NPS):

___ preliminary determination of individual listing (36 CFR 67) has been requested
___ previously listed in the National Register
___ previously determined eligible by the National Register
___ designated a National Historic Landmark
___ recorded by Historic American Buildings Survey # __________
___ recorded by Historic American Engineering Record # __________
___ recorded by Historic American Landscape Survey # __________

Primary location of additional data:

___ State Historic Preservation Office
___ Other State agency
___ Federal agency
___ Local government
___ University
___ Other

Name of repository: Hunterdon County Historical Society

Historic Resources Survey Number (if assigned): ________________
10. Geographical Data

Acreage of Property 5.2

Use either the UTM system or latitude/longitude coordinates

Latitude/Longitude Coordinates (decimal degrees)
Datum if other than WGS84:__________
(enter coordinates to 6 decimal places)
1. Latitude: 40.636246  Longitude: -74.882562
2. Latitude: 40.636146  Longitude: -74.884265
3. Latitude: 40.635055  Longitude: -74.883396
4. Latitude: 40.635135  Longitude: -74.882286

Or

UTM References
Datum (indicated on USGS map):

☐ NAD 1927  or  ☐ NAD 1983

1. Zone:  Easting:  Northing:
2. Zone:  Easting:  Northing:
3. Zone:  Easting:  Northing:
4. Zone:  Easting:  Northing:

Verbal Boundary Description (Describe the boundaries of the property.)

The nominated property includes a 5.2-acre parcel that begins along Old Allerton Road (Hunterdon County Road No. 633), at the southeast corner of lot 4, the lot that the McCloughan Mansion and outbuildings are sited on. From this point, the boundary line extends 314.67 feet west along the common property line of lot 4 and lot 5, thence 330.37 feet northwest along the common property line of lot 4 and lot 7 to a point that is shared by lot 4, lot 7, and lot 9, thence 286.36 feet northeast to the far corner of the Runkle Cemetery at the point common to lot 4, lot 9 and lot 10, thence 527.27 feet east along the abandoned roadway to the junction of Old Allerton Road, thence south 420.06 feet to the point of beginning.
Boundary Justification (Explain why the boundaries were selected.)

The verbal boundary description describes the outline of the property that has been associated with the McCloughan Mansion since the 1940s when it was reduced from 184 42/100 acres to its current size of 5.2 acres.67 The description also matches that of the legal description included in the most recent deed from June 20, 2012.68

11. Form Prepared By

name/title: Leaha Bovino
organization: Roger Williams University
street & number: 130 Stanton Road
city or town: Flemington state: New Jersey zip code: 08822
e-mail: Leaha_Bovino@yahoo.com
telephone: 908-303-5938
date: May 16, 2014

Additional Documentation

Submit the following items with the completed form:

- Maps: A USGS map or equivalent (7.5 or 15 minute series) indicating the property's location.

- Sketch map for historic districts and properties having large acreage or numerous resources. Key all photographs to this map.

- Additional items: (Check with the SHPO, TPO, or FPO for any additional items.)

---

67 Deed of Sale from Browne Morgan to George L. Gilbert et al, 1 May 1837, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 463, page 177. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.
68 Deed of Sale from Michael Margulies to McCloughan Mansion LLC., 20 June 2012, Annandale, New Jersey, Deed Book 2895, page 579. Hunterdon County Archives, Flemington, NJ.
McCloughan Mansion
Name of Property

Hunterdon NJ
County and State

The McCloughan Mansion

Map of Annandale vicinity with the McCloughan Mansion marked.
McCloughan Mansion
Name of Property

Hunterdon NJ
County and State

Photographs
Submit clear and descriptive photographs. The size of each image must be 1600x1200 pixels (minimum), 3000x2000 preferred, at 300 ppi (pixels per inch) or larger. Key all photographs to the sketch map. Each photograph must be numbered and that number must correspond to the photograph number on the photo log. For simplicity, the name of the photographer, photo date, etc. may be listed once on the photograph log and doesn’t need to be labeled on every photograph.

Photo Log
The following information is true for all photographs:

Name of Property: McCloughan Mansion
City or Vicinity: Annandale
County: Hunterdon
State: New Jersey
Photographer: Leaha Bovino
Date Photographed: March 11, 2014

1. East Elevation (NJ_Hunterdon County_McCloughan Mansion_0001)
2. East and South Elevations (NJ_Hunterdon County_McCloughan Mansion_0001)
3. South Elevation (NJ_Hunterdon County_McCloughan Mansion_0001)
4. South and West Elevations (NJ_Hunterdon County_McCloughan Mansion_0001)
5. West Elevation (NJ_Hunterdon County_McCloughan Mansion_0001)
6. West and North Elevations (NJ_Hunterdon County_McCloughan Mansion_0001)
7. North Elevation (NJ_Hunterdon County_McCloughan Mansion_0001)
8. North and East Elevations (NJ_Hunterdon County_McCloughan Mansion_0001)
McCloughan Mansion
Name of Property

Hunterdon NJ
County and State

(The McCloughan Mansion, Hunterdon County, NJ, #1)

(The McCloughan Mansion, Hunterdon County, NJ, #2)
McCloughan Mansion
Name of Property

Hunterdon NJ
County and State

(The McCloughan Mansion, Hunterdon County, NJ, #5)

(The McCloughan Mansion, Hunterdon County, NJ, #6)
McCloughan Mansion
Name of Property

Hunterdon NJ
County and State

(The McCloughan Mansion, Hunterdon County, NJ, #7)

(The McCloughan Mansion, Hunterdon County, NJ, #8)